

USDC SDNY  
DOCUMENT  
ELECTRONICALLY FILED  
DOC #:  
DATE FILED: 6/22/2022

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

PAVLE ZIVKOVIC, on behalf of himself and  
others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

LAURA CHRISTY LLC d/b/a VALBELLA,  
LAURA CHRISTY MIDTOWN LLC, DAVID  
GHATANFARD, and GENCO LUCA,

Defendants.

17-CV-00553-GHW

**JUDGMENT**

WHEREAS this action was tried to a jury and, on April 11, 2022, the jury rendered a verdict in favor of Plaintiff Pavle Zivkovic as well as in favor of the Subclasses that the Court certified on November 13, 2018 (Dkt. No. 147); and

WHEREAS, in accordance with Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(c)(3)(b), the names of the individuals whom notice was directed, who have not requested exclusion, and whom the Court finds to be class members are attached hereto as “Exhibit A” (the “Subclass Members”); and

WHEREAS the Court has calculated the total damages of judgment due to the Subclass Members and to Plaintiff Zivkovic based on the verdict rendered by the jury (Dkt. No. 283);

It is HEREBY, ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that the Clerk of Court shall enter judgment as follows:

1. Pursuant to the jury’s verdict, Judgment shall be entered in favor of the Subclasses and against Defendants Laura Christy LLC, Laura Christy Midtown LLC, and David Ghatanfard, jointly and severally, in the amount of \$4,509,868.78 which includes prejudgment interest (the “Class Jury Award”).
2. Plaintiffs’ counsel, Joseph & Kirschenbaum LLP, shall be awarded \$1,503,274.56 as attorneys’ fees which shall be paid out of the Class Jury Award.

3. In addition, lead plaintiffs Ricardo Sanchez, Fernando Marin, and Alejandra C. Rendon shall each be awarded \$5,000 as service awards, in addition to the individual respective amounts they are entitled to from this Judgment. These service awards shall also be paid out of the Class Jury Award.

4. In addition to the sum owed pursuant to Class Jury Award, the Court also awards class counsel, Joseph & Kirschenbaum LLP, \$561,948.50 in attorneys' fees pursuant to the fee-shifting provisions of the New York Labor Law ("NYLL") as well as \$20,200.57 in costs pursuant to that statute for a total of \$582,149.07.

5. Accordingly, in the aggregate, Judgment shall be entered in favor of the Subclasses and against Defendants Laura Christy LLC, Laura Christy Midtown LLC, and David Ghatanfard, jointly and severally, in the amount of \$5,092,017.85 which includes prejudgment interest (the "Class Judgment").

6. Pursuant to New York Labor Law § 198(4), any or all of the \$5,092,017.85 Class Judgment amount which is not paid within ninety (90) days of this Judgment shall be automatically increased at the rate of 15% of the Judgment.

7. In addition to the Class Judgment amount, judgment shall also be entered in favor of Pavle Zivkovic and against Defendants Genco Luca, Laura Christy Midtown LLC, and David Ghatanfard, as follows:

<b>Defendant</b>	<b>Judgment Amount</b>
Genco Luca	\$25,000.00
Laura Christy Midtown LLC	\$452,500.00
David Ghatanfard	\$202,500.00
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$680,000</b>

8. The Court awards attorneys' fees pursuant to the fee-shifting provisions of the New York City Human Rights Law in the amount of \$7,060.00 in favor of Plaintiffs' counsel, Joseph & Kirschenbaum LLP, and against Defendants Genco Luca, David Ghatanfard, and Laura Christy Midtown LLC, jointly and severally.

9. In sum, and for the avoidance of doubt, Judgment is hereby entered against each Defendant in the following amounts:


<b>Defendant</b>	<b>Judgment Amounts</b>
Laura Christy LLC, Laura Christy Midtown LLC, and David Ghatanfard, jointly and severally	\$5,092,017.85
Laura Christy Midtown LLC	\$452,500.00
David Ghatanfard	\$202,500.00
Genco Luca	\$25,000.00
Genco Luca, David Ghatanfard, and Laura Christy Midtown LLC, jointly and severally	\$7,060
<b>Total Judgment</b>	<b>\$5,779,077.85</b>

10. All the aforementioned judgment amounts shall be subject to post-judgment interest from the date this judgment is entered until the date these judgment amounts are fully satisfied at the rate fixed pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1961.

11. The Clerk of Court is directed to close this case.

SO ORDERED.

Dated: June 22, 2022  
New York, New York

  
GREGORY H. WOODS  
United States District Judge

# **EXHIBIT A**

**I. Valbella Meatpacking Subclass Members**

<b>Employee Name</b>
Abazi, Qerim
Abrau, Ronald
Adorno, Marcielo
Ajala, Malik
Aktas, Mehmet H.
Alicka, Armand
Alikaj, Armand
Alla, Albert
Alomar, Irina
Alonso, Antonio
Altas, Onder
Andrada, Marcos A.
Arellano, Israel
Arucevic, Edmir
Avendano, Enrique
Azemi, Shkelqim
Azevedo, Luis Filipe
Azuni, Klaidi
Bakalli, Arvit
Baldeon, Luis
Balska, Irena
Bancila, Gheorghe O.
Barbosa, Laugenice
Beaven, Laura
Besimovski, Adnan
Bolotbekova, Elvira
Borsky, Victoria
Bozal, Deniz
Brown, Danielle
Brown, Kaitlin G.
Bucinca, Rigon
Buczowska, Magdalena
Bytyqi, Faton
Calfin, Christopher L.
Calixto, Carlos
Caltabiano, Mark
Castillo, Henrique
Cela, Ermir
Cervone, Gina Marie
Cesare, Jennifer
Ceylan, Cihan
Chodhury, Ruhel

Chowdhury, Mohshin
Chowdhury, Ziaur
Chulkova, Irina
Cici, Keidi
Closs, Daniel
Colakel, Kemal
Connell, Elisha
Cristescu, Adrian
Dani, Alfred
Daniel, Closs
Das, Ratan K.
Deak, Tescia
Dezzutti, Brianne M.
Diaz, Andres
Diaz, Ray
DiDonato, Natalia
Dominguez, Joaquin
Dreisbach, Katherine H
Dressler, Jacqueline
Durman, Burak
Errico, Mario
Escalier, Alvaro M.
Esenlik, Emre
Fezaj, Haki
Forlong, Roy A.
Franco, Raul A.
Frrokaj, Bekim
Frrokaj, Blerim
Frrokaj, Burim
Frrokaj, Rafi
Garcia, Guillermo C.
Garcia, Guillermo T.
Garcia, Maykol
Gashi, Shaban
Gatica, Samuel
Geckil, Ulas
Gifoli, Massimo
Goddard-Braithwaite, Tara A.
Gomez, Fernando
Guzman, Cristian
Hadzibrahimovic, Sani
Hadzibrahimovic, Verdon
Halilaj, Anthony
Haque, Athikul

Heras, Marco G
Hernandez, David
Hernandez, Lucas
Herrera, Javier
Hopson, Simone R.
Hossain, Sorwer
Jadlovski-Koleszar, Rosa
Jara, Hector
Kadyrova, Amina
Kajtazi, Armend
Karim, Md A.
Kasmi, Amer
Kasmi, Gent
Kilpatrick, Michael
Kish, Tiffinie
Klement, Andrew
Kochurova, Olha
Konca, Ulas
Kowzan, Emily
Krasniqi, Argon
Krasniqi, Arjanit
Krasniqi, Shkelqim
Kreshnik, Fejzaj
Kudra, Goran
Kusari, Hanor
Lala, Petrit
Lamaj, Klodian
Lambert, Barbara
Ljuljudurj, Lindon
Lovric, Hanna
Lucgjonjj, Viktor
Mahir, Ahmed
Makulova, Adel
Maloku, Shkoderan
Marin, Fernando
Matos, Ivana
McDougal, Ellie
Mema, Jusuf
Miocic, Zeljko
Mitri, Siljon
Mora, Adrienne
Muhaxher, Gramos
Muhshin, Ahmed
Mulaj, Buyar
Musaj, Tush

Nimani, Burim
Nomani, Henri
Noreci, Olsian
Ochoa, Juan
Olate, Edwin E.
Oshlani, Bahri
Oshlani, Florije
Ozturk, Sercan
Paguay, Oscar P.
Paiva, Christiane
Panaccio, Tamara
Papa, Elio
Pashako, Ertis
Pashako, Florence
Paska, Mikel
Patino, Alfredo
Pepaj, Arijan
Perdedaj, Zef
Pereira-Morales, Juan Arnaldo
Pinos, Jorge
Pireva, Florent
Pllana, Leutrim
Portilla-Andrade, Jorge
Qosja, Bashkim
Qubreli, Genc
Quiros, Alejandro
Race, Derek
Raci, Agush
Rahman, Luthfer
Rahman, Mahbubur
Ramaj, Lirim
Rendon, Johan
Romano, John J.
Romero, Armando
Romero, Ivan
Rondon, Ender J.
Rosca, Ion
Rraci, Bashkim
Rraci, Imer
Ruiz, Israel R.
Sajid, Hassan
Sanchez, Higinio
Sanchez, Ricardo
Sandede, Unal



Sanic, Hector R.
Scerri, Byron L.
Shala, Besfort
Shala, Sali
Shano, Etleva
Shano, Ivi
Shonar, Imran H
Shonar, Mohammed
Simmons, Francine B.
Sinsdale, Stephen
Titkova, Evgeniya
Torun, Ali
Ubdin, Misba
Uddin, MD A.
Uslu, Fikret
Uzzaman, Shamim
Vidas, Denis
Vita, Jemina
Xhemajli, Ekrem
Xhemajli, Shkelzen
Yilmaz, Tunch
Yilmaz, Unsal L.
Yozzo, Bricen
Zeidman, Nicole
Zherka, Agron
Zivkovic, Pavle

## II. Valbella Midtown Subclass Members

Employee Name
Acevedo, Dariana
Agzzoum, Aly
Alane, Rachid
Altas, Onder
Alvarez, Ivan
Aslantas, Ferhat
Atroce, Mario
Avella, Vito
Avendano, Enrique
Avila, William S.
Ayar, Turker
Azcatl, Edgar
Azir, Uddin

Balska, Irena
Bekimi, Albino
Berisha, Albert
Bolmonte, Herminio
Boyadjan, Yuliya
Bravo, Luis
Brown, John
Brown, Kaitlin G.
Caka, Marko
Calle, Luis
Caltabiano, Mark
Canales, Jose
Candia, Felicito
Casales, Juan
Cassavitis, Ashley
Castillo, Henrique
Cedeno, Oliver H.
Celmeta, Ardian
Centeno-Martinez, Javier
Chino, Noe
Cici, Keidi
Cohen, Arielle
Cvetrovsra, Marija
Dalbery, Scot
Dalipi, Arget
Darcourt, Joseph
Diaz, Ray
Dimitrova, Karmena
Duque, Alexander
Durman, Burak
Esenlik, Emre
Fabiani, Julio
Farlow, Troy J.
Fernandez, Jose A.
Forlong, Roy
Frrokaj, Bekim
Frrokaj, Blerim
Garcia, Maykol
Garcia, Saul
Gashi, Agon
Gashi, Dardan
Gaviria, Gloria

Geckil, Ulas
Gifoli, Massimo
Gimenez, Giorgio
Giordano Jr., Joseph
Gjini, Zef
Goldman, Helena
Gomez, Sandra
Gonzalez, Antonio
Guzman, Cesar Ivan
Hahija, Blerim
Hardy, Patrick W.
Heras, Marco G.
Hernandez, David
Hernandez, Delia
Hirschhorn, Andrew
Hoxha, Granit
Islaim, Syed
Islam, Rasiquil
Jakaj, Mikel
Jaramillo, Selso W.
Jara, Hector
Jones, Natalie
Juka, Herald
Kasmi, Gent
Kasumi, Rijad
Kelly, Caitlin
Knezevic, Vojislav
Kraja, Eren
Krasniqi, Besnik
Krasniqi, Blerim
Leca, Catalina
Lee, Brian J.
Lopez, Rosendo
Lovric, Hanna
Lukacevic, Andrijana
Macar, Andelko
Martinovic, Kire J.
Maldonado, Jose Luis
Malfetano, Ryan J.
Marku, Freddy
Mashi, Mario
Mavraj, Ermal
Mema, Jusef
Mercado, Tiffany B.
Mercedes, Armando

Miah, Moynul
Michos, Diana
Moctesuma, Rafael
Molina, Windsor
Mucollari, Hysen
Muniz, Antonio
Nikcevic, Ivana
Nino, Daniel
Nistor, Ionel
Onofre, Antonio De Jesus
Orozco, Andres Felipe
Ortiz, Juan M.
Ozturk, Sercan
Paguay, Manuel F.
Paguay, Oscar
Pashako, Ertis
Pashako, Florence
Pashako, Stephany A.
Pelico-Perez, Urbano B.
Pereira, Juan
Perolli, Drilon
Petkovic, Bojan
Pllana, Florim
Poppsoaba, Emiliya
Pusic, Nenad
Qoshja, Liburn
Queiroz, Louiz
Quiros, Alejandro
Quizhri, Wilson
Race, Derek
Radoncic, Jenuz
Rakaj, Ervis
Rakos, Robert
Ramirez, Jesus
Ramos, Rogelio
Rendon, Alejandra C.
Rivera, Jaime
Rodpothong, Kanda
Rojas, Juan Carlos
Romano, Roberto
Romero, Armando
Romero, Ivan
Rosa, Paola
Rraci, Bashkim

Rucda, Antonio
Ruiz, Alex
Ryan, Quinn
Sajid, Hassan
Salgado, Juan
Sanchez, Christian
Sanchez, Johnathan
Sanchez, Ricardo
Sani, Bruno
Sarmiento, Jose
Sebbag, Yonni
Secolo, Angelo
Seferi, Milaim
Shannen, Timothy G.
Shokdra, Arben
Siguencia, Marco
Silva, Mauricio
Simaku, Endri
Simone, Kirstein
Simonetti, Cristiano
Slamna, Daniel
Smith, Brittany N.
Sornoza, Joshua
Tacuri, Vicente
Tononi, Fabio
Topal, Ismail
Uslu, Fikret
Uzzaman, Shamim
Valenca, Lais
Vasquez, Marco
Vazquez, Ricardo
Velasco, Erick
Veseli, Valmir
Wdowiak, Magdalena
Yilmaz, Tunch
Ymeri, Aridon
Yuce, Murat
Yungberg, Sofia
Zivkovic, Pavle